Take This Job and Love It: Findings from a Survey of Home Visitors

Rose Greene, Eunju Lee, Nina Esaki, and Manrong Chen
Center for Human Services Research
University at Albany
Overview of Presentation

- HFNY Program and Evaluation
- Study Design of Worker Survey
- Findings from Worker Survey
  - Worker Characteristics
  - Results: work environment, job satisfaction, worker burn-out
  - Implications for Practice
Healthy Families New York (HFNY)

- A child maltreatment prevention initiative
- Expectant and new mothers screened for risks for child maltreatment
- Paraprofessional home visitation
- Modeled after Healthy Families America
Location of HFNY Sites
HFNY Program Goals

- Promote optimal child health and development
- Enhance positive parent-child interactions
- Increase parental self-sufficiency
- Prevent child abuse and neglect
HFNY Evaluation Methods

- Randomized Trial
- HFNY Management Information System
- Process Studies
Study Design of Worker Survey
Measures

- Socio-demographic characteristics
- Experiences in human services
- Standardized instruments on:
  - Supervision
  - Empathy, Mastery, and Intent to Leave
  - Work Environment
  - Job Satisfaction and Worker Burnout
Data Collection

- Fall 2004
- 7 Sites (3 Upstate/ 4 NYC)
- Site Visit
- Return by Mail
- Incentives
- Confidentiality
Response Rates by Site

- Doc: 90%
- Bashful: 100%
- Happy: 100%
- Grumpy: 100%
- Sneezy: 88%
- Sleepy: 93%
- Dopey: 75%
- All: 94%
Worker Characteristics
# Demographic Characteristics by Site

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site</th>
<th>Median Age</th>
<th>Have Children</th>
<th>Married</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Doc</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bashful</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happy</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grumpy</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sneezy</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleepy</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dopey</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Education by Site

- Some Grad
- 4yr College
- 2yr College
- Some College
- HS Only
Race and Ethnicity

Upstate

NYC

- White
- Black
- Hispanic
Immigrant Status

Upstate

NYC

US Born

Immigrant

N=32

N=22

N=9
HH Income and Marital Status by Site

Income and Married Status Comparison

- Doc
- Bashful
- Happy
- Grumpy
- Sneezy
- Sleepy
- Dopey
- All

Income Range:
- $0
- $10,000
- $20,000
- $30,000
- $40,000
- $50,000
- $60,000
- $70,000

Marital Status Percentage:
- 0%
- 10%
- 20%
- 30%
- 40%
- 50%
- 60%
- 70%
- 80%
- 90%
- 100%

Legend:
- Pink: Income
- Blue: Married
Findings from Worker Survey

Supervision, Empathy and Intent to Leave
Supervision

- Supervision Questionnaire (Shulman - 1982)
- 14 dimensions of supervision: little variation in individual dimensions by site
- 2 other summary questions about supervision – satisfaction and helpfulness
- General satisfaction
Supervisor Satisfaction by Site

Percent of Employees

% satisfied % not satisfied

Bashful Happy Doc Grumpy Sneezy Sleepy Dopey

Percent of Employee

0% 20% 40% 60% 80% 100%
Upstate/NYC Comparison

Satisfied w/ Supervisor*

* p < .05
Role Clarity

- Caplan et al. (1975) – 4 item scale
- Measures degree of clarity of expectations on the job
- No significant variation on total score by location, education, or race
Empathy: Two Dimensions

- Empathic Concern & Emotional Contagion
- Empathic Concern – 5 item instrument by Davis (1983)
- Emotional Contagion – 6 item instrument by Dillard & Hunter (1986)
- Both use 5-point Likert scale
- No differences by location, education, or race
Intent to Leave

- 4 questions on intent to leave:
  - Read ad in last year
  - Sent copies of resume in last year
  - Intend to look for job in 1 year
  - Intend to leave in 3 years
- Yes/no responses
- Significant differences in read ad by education, intend to leave in 3 years by location and tenure
- NYC and those with fewer months as FSW more likely to leave in 3 years
Intent to Leave: The Whole Sample

Read Ad in Last Year: 71%

Intend to Leave 3 Years: 57%
Intent to Leave: The whole sample

Intend to Look 1 Year: 45%

Sent Resume in Last Year: 29%
Audience Participation

Sample Questionnaire
Findings from Worker Survey

Work Environment, Job Satisfaction and Burnout
Work Environment Scale (WES)

- Widely used instrument
- Measures the workers’ perception of their work
- Used 7 Scales
  - Involvement
  - Autonomy
  - Task Orientation
  - Work Pressure
  - Clarity
  - Managerial Control
  - Innovation
Work Pressure and Autonomy

- **Work Pressure**
  - The degree to which high work demands and time pressure dominate the job milieu
  - Ex. There is consistent pressure to keep working

- **Autonomy**
  - How much employees are encouraged to be self-sufficient and to make their own decisions
  - Ex. Employees are encouraged to make their own decisions
Work Pressure and Autonomy by Site

Correlation Coefficient = -.472**
Job Satisfaction Survey (JSS)

- One of the most utilized instruments
- Developed for human service organizations
- Total score and 9 Subscales
- 9 subscales: Pay, Promotion, Supervision, Fringe Benefits, Contingent Rewards, Operating Conditions, Coworkers, Nature of Work, and Communication
Total Job Satisfaction by Site

Doc  Bashful  Happy  Grumpy  Sneezy  Sleepy  Dopey
Maslach Burnout Inventory (MBI)

- Emotional Exhaustion
  - Describe feelings of being emotionally overextended and exhausted by one’s work
    - Ex. I feel used up at the end of the workday

- Depersonalization
  - Describe an unfeeling and impersonal response toward recipients of one’s care or service
    - Ex. I don’t really care what happens to some recipients

- Personal Accomplishment
  - Describe feelings of competence and successful achievement in one’s work with people
    - Ex. I’ve accomplished many worthwhile things in this job
Are You Burned Out from Your Job?

- The questionnaire is composed of the items for the emotional exhaustion scale
- Norm was created by testing a large sample of people working in social services: 21
- Higher number means more emotional exhaustion
Emotional Exhaustion by Site

![Graph showing emotional exhaustion by site](image-url)
Findings on Job Satisfaction, Intent to Leave and Burnout
Research on Work Environment and Job Satisfaction

- Limited research on work environment on job performance
- A few studies show organization climate influences worker effectiveness, morale, and satisfaction
- SES and work experience have some impact
Findings on Work Environment and Job Satisfaction

- Higher the work pressure, lower the job satisfaction
- Higher the worker autonomy, higher the job satisfaction
- Upstate workers were less happy with their job
- Older workers were more happy with their job
Research on
Job Satisfaction and Intent to Leave

▪ Research show consistently significant relationships between job satisfaction, organizational commitment, turnover intentions and actual turnover
▪ Less satisfied workers indicate that they are more likely to leave
▪ Age, race, and work experience has some impact
Findings on Job Satisfaction and Intent Leave

- Total job satisfaction is a significant factor predicting all four measures of intent to leave
  - Read ads last year
  - Intent to leave in 3 year
  - Intent to leave in 1 year
  - Sent resume last year
- Hispanic workers were more likely to have sent resume in the past year
Research on Mastery and Emotional Burnout

▪ Much emphasis on the relationship between clients’ sense of control and better outcomes
▪ Limited research on worker’s sense of control on job effectiveness
▪ Studies found that increased worker control may lead to less stress on the job and an increase in worker effectiveness
Mastery Scale

- Pearlin & Schooler (1978) - 7 item scale regarding empowerment
- Modified “on the job”
  - Ex. I have little control over the things that happen to me on my job
- Same instrument for client interviews in randomized trial
Findings on Mastery and Worker Burnout

- Limited impact of age and other demographic characteristics on worker burnout
- Higher the sense of mastery, less likely to feel burned out
- Workers in NYC sites were more likely to feel burned out
Summary and Implications
Summary

- Our findings suggest that empowered workers are more satisfied with their work and less likely to burn out.
- Parallel process models suggest that organizations that empower workers are more capable of empowering clients.
- Worker empowerment may lead to better program outcomes.
Implications: Ways to Empower workers

- Creating employment settings that provide participatory management and allow workers to make independent decisions
- Providing advanced training and support for actualizing special interests and talents of workers
- Promoting a collaborative team-like approach among colleagues where there is shared power and information among all levels of staff
Implications: Ways to Empower Workers

- Offering a “safe” organizational environment which allows workers to openly address concerns
- Providing administrative “markers” providing recognition and validation of workers’ efforts (ex. through promotional opportunities, better salaries, and comfortable working conditions)